Process evaluation report

Prepared by:
EX ANTE Tanácsadó Iroda Kft.

Client:
HÁRFA Hálózat
a Regionális Fejlesztésért
Alapítvány

Date:

15 May 2023

The process evaluation report has been developed in the framework of the project VP/2020/003/0218

"Initiative for innovative integrated interventions in Miskolc - 4IM (Miskolc shall be a place for everyone!) - Miskolc's initiative for innovative and integrated social services and employment development in Miskolc (Our place is Miskolc!)".

www.exante.hu

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY 5
2. PROJECT BASIC DATA, PROJECT OBJECTIVES 8
2.1 Basic project data 8
2.2 Objectives of the project 8
2.3 Target areas and target groups of the project 9
3. IMPACT ASSESSMENT METHODOLOGY 10
3.1 Documents and databases used in the evaluation 10
3.2 Set of criteria taken into account in the evaluation 11
3.3 Examining the links between the 4IM project and the EU's Strategic Framework on Roma 11
4. AREAS, PRIORITIES, WORK PACKAGES 15
5.1 Setting up the necessary structures and capacity building 19
5.2 Reaching people/households in need 23
5.3 Methodological coordination and guidance 27
5.4 Impact assessment of the project activities 29
5.5 Transnational cooperation, mainstreaming and dissemination 29
5.6 Project management 31
5. MONITORING, INDICATORS 33
6. EFFICIENCY OF RESOURCE USE 35
7. SUSTAINABILITY 37
8. PROPOSALS 38

Figure list

1st figure Sub-objectives of the 4IM project 9
2. figure work packages implemented under the of the 4IM project 15
3. figure Gantt chart of the 4IM project 17
4. figure The hierarchy of the organisations set up under the 4IM project 20

Table list

1st table 4.1 Basic data for the 4IM project 8
2. table 1.2 Indicators measuring the living conditions of the direct target group 12
3. table 1.2 Process indicators related to the project implementation - partnership 13
4. result indicators related to the project implementation - increasing Roma employment 13
5. table 4.1 the timing of its main professional activities and the sequencing of the 4IM project 15
6.. table Work Package 1 - Setting up the necessary structures and capacity building 19
7. table Work Package 2 - Reaching people/households in need 23
8. table Work Package 3 - Methodological coordination and guidance 27

9. table Work Package 4 - Impact assessment of project activities 29
10. table Work Package 5 - Transnational cooperation, mainstreaming and dissemination 29
11. table Work Package 6 - Project Management 31
12 table. 4IM project indicator commitments and achievements 34
13. table Distribution of resources between consortium partners 35
14. table Use of resource for the period 27.11.2021-20.11.26.2022 35

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Municipality of Miskolc, as the leader of the consortium, and its consortium partners, the Abaújrakezdés Public Benefit Association, the European Association for Innovation in Local Development (AEIDL), the Network for Regional Development Foundation (HÁRFA), the Municipality of Košice, the University of Miskolc, in the framework of the EaSI Programme, successfully applied in October 2020 for the "Initiative for innovative integrated interventions in Miskolc - 4IM (Miskolc shall be a place for everyone!) Implementation of the urban initiative for innovative and integrated social services, employment development in Miskolc (Our place is Miskolc!)" (hereinafter: 4IM project).

The EaSI Programme (European Programme for Empowerment and Social Innovation) is the European Union's programme to support employment, social policy and worker mobility. EaSI pays particular attention to social innovation.

"The key social innovation elements of the 4IM project are:

- The model programme is area-based - that is, it develops a specific solution for deprived neighbourhoods.
- It takes an integrated approach, responding to the complexity of problems in the lives of people living in deprived neighbourhoods with integrated solutions.
- It is participatory, i.e. the project is carried out with the participation of the people living in the area and contributes to improving their self-organisation.
- It builds new social links and cooperation between all actors involved in the regeneration of deprived neighbourhoods.
- The changes will bring social changes that will benefit the whole of Miskolc"[1]

The 4IM project procured the impact assessment of project activities, the preparation of a process evaluation report and a results evaluation report. The Network for Regional Development Foundation commissioned Ex Ante Consulting Ltd. to carry out the activities. The impact assessments will be carried out in the following periods: the process assessment will be carried out at the mid-term of the project (15 February 2023 - 15 May 2023), the outcome assessment at the end of the project (27 November 2023 - 1 May 2024).

The mid-term process evaluation relies exclusively on qualitative methods (e.g.: interviews with relevant actors, secondary analysis of project documents and methodological guidelines), quantitative methods (e.g.: control group analysis) were not used. In order to prepare the present process evaluation report, all the consortium members implementing the project were contacted during the semi-structured interviews, 11 interviews were conducted among the consortium members implementing the 4IM project, the experiences and results of these interviews will be included in the process evaluation report.

The EU Roma strategic framework indicators have been integrated into the evaluation process. The concept of the 4IM project was designed with a particular focus on the Roma minority, and therefore indicators related to the objectives of the EU's strategic framework on Roma were taken into account in the evaluation.

[1] The 4IM Integrated Service Package for the target group for work package 2.4

The present progress evaluation report examines the activities carried out so far (Q1-Q5) in the framework of the 4IM project on the basis of a predefined set of criteria (relevance assessment, project implementation schedule, efficiency and usefulness assessment, participation assessment, partnership assessment, identification of success and failure factors, sustainability) and proposes, on a work package by work package basis, to overcome the difficulties and barriers identified during the evaluation in the next phase of project implementation (Q6-Q10).

Projects in the field of social inclusion typically have a complex path of problems and require a particular commitment on the part of the implementers to overcome these often complex difficulties. The interviews with the highly qualified members of the consortium revealed a high level of commitment to improving the living conditions of the target group, but the results of the project do not reflect the quality of the competences of the implementing partners individually. The reasons for the incomplete results were attributed to the following:

- in the introductory phase of the project, the partners did not give enough weight to the project tasks to be carried out in consortium cooperation, and there was a noticeable lack of a common understanding of the project objective that would put the activities into context. The quarterly consortium meetings, in the absence of proper governance, were essentially a formal, partner-by-partner reporting exercise, and this forum proved insufficient for meaningful professional discussion. The various "working groups" advocated by the professional manager have become an opaque system.
- the methodological guidance - which the professional manager essentially intended to provide as a single person - was late and incomplete in its approach, which did not provide a sufficient basis for the systematisation and evaluation of services and support provided by social and other organisations in contact with the target group. Thus, the service packages have been prepared independently of this analysis, without a sufficiently integrated and sustainable approach.

As indicated above, in the process evaluation report, detailed recommendations per work package are presented to the consortium in the chapter Recommendations, of which the following interventions are urged at project level:

- the creation of a programme steering committee, integrating the consortium members and the organisations set up by the project (e.g. the Resource Centre), which will be jointly responsible for the development and dissemination of project results, instead of a single person management.
- the further development of methodological documents to fulfil their role in supporting the adaptability of pilot projects and to support the ongoing analyses that are essential for the further development of new and integrated service packages. An important commitment of the 4IM project is that the new integrated systems will, among other things, draw on the analysis of the dysfunctionality of existing systems, the results of a household survey of people living in the target areas, in order to implement Principle 14 of the European Pillar of Social Rights.
- we believe that focused, small-scale interventions are more appropriate for a pilot project at such an early stage, rather than seeking and finding a solution for everything at once approach, and therefore we recommend that the services that are set up to support the target group (households or individuals) should be rethought, taking into account their sustainability aspects.

- learning from similar projects, learning from each other would be a useful input for the current phase of the project, and we also suggest to channel in the practical experience of the international project partner (AEIDL).

2. PROJECT BASIC DATA, PROJECT OBJECTIVES

This chapter briefly describes the basic data, objectives, target areas and target groups of the project titled "Initiative for innovative integrated interventions in Miskolc - 4IM (Miskolc shall be a place for everyone!) Municipality initiative for the innovative and integrated social services and employment development in Miskolc (Our place is Miskolc!)" (hereinafter: 4IM project).

2.1 Basic project data

1 table 4.1 Basic data for the 4IM project

Project basic data	
Project ID	VP/2020/003/0218
Grant agreement number	VS/2021/0249
Project title	"Initiative for innovative integrated interventions in Miskolc - 4IM (Miskolc shall be a place for everyone!) Municipality initiative for innovative and integrated social services, employment development in Miskolc (Our place is Miskolc!)
Programme	EUROPEAN PROGRAMME FOR EMPLOYMENT AND SOCIAL INNOVATION "EASI" 2014-2020
Consortium leader	The Municipality of Miskolc City with County Rights
Consortium partners:	Abaújrakezdés Public Benefit Association, AEIDL (European Association for Innovation in Local Development), HÁRFA (Network for Regional Development Foundation), Municipality of Košice, University of Miskolc
Associate members	dr. Ámbédkár Youth Association, Dialóg a Közösségekért Közhasznú Egyesület (Dialogue for Communities Public Benefit Association)
The period of implementation:	30 months (Q1-Q10)
Project starting date	27.11.2021.
Estimated date of completion of the project	26.05.2024.
Maximum amount of grant contracted	EUR 1 065 398.42
Grant form	Non-repayable grant

Source: VS/2021/0249 grant agreement, own editing

2.2 Objectives of the project

The objective of the 4IM project is to introduce a new, pilot social, employment and service delivery model, to develop integrated interventions and institutional structures, and to establish innovative partnerships between public, municipal, civil and private sector stakeholders in the two deprived neighbourhoods (target areas) of Tetemvár and Bábonyibérc. To be able to provide integrated responses and solutions to complex problems, it is essential to create a broad network of partners. In line with Principle 14 of the EU's European Pillar of Social Rights, the 4IM project aims to develop a service system that makes services and various forms of financial and in-kind support accessible to all. In the framework of the 4IM project, an adaptable, scalable model will be developed, which can be transferred to other segregated areas in Miskolc and other Hungarian and European cities.

The sub-objectives of the project: The sub-objectives of the 4IM project are presented in the figure below.

1 figure Sub-objectives of the 4IM project

Source: 4IM - Methodology and guidelines for work package 3.2, own editing

The implementation of the 4IM project is in line with the Integrated Urban Development Strategy[2] and the Equal Opportunities Plan[3].

2.3 Target areas and target groups of the project

The two neighbourhoods targeted by the 4IM project in Miskolc:

- Bábonyibérc,
- Tetemvár.

Two main target groups in the target areas:

- Households having registered residents already covered by the social protection system,
- Those entitled to but not yet recieving social protection - households with partially or not fully registered residents.[4]

Subgroups:

- People living in the target areas whose motivation, work experience or level of education allows them to easily integrate into the business development/employment market.
- Youth (especially targeting Roma youth at risk).
- Women with several children (especially Roma women).
- Older people and people with disabilities.[5]

[2] https://www.miskolc.hu/sites/default/files/egyszeru_oldal/beagyazhato_csatolmanyok/2022-05-18/82287/its.pdf
[3] https://www.miskolc.hu/sites/default/files/egyszeru_oldal/beagyazhato_csatolmanyok/2022-05-18/82287/hep_2021-2026_miskolc.pdf
[4] The wording of the target group definition is difficult to interpret and needs to be clarified. The distinction between residents registered and not registered in the social assistance system, or those who do or do not comply with the obligation to declare their address, is explainable.
[5] 4IM - Methodology and guidelines for work package 3.2 for municipality-level situation assessment, policy change and planning process, resulting in an innovative and tested service package for social inclusion at the end of the 4IM project

3. IMPACT ASSESSMENT METHODOLOGY

The impact assessments will be carried out in the following periods: the process assessment will be carried out at the mid-term of the project (15 February 2023 - 15 May 2023), the outcome assessment at the end of the project (27 November 2023 - 1 May 2024).

The **process evaluation** refers to how the project action plan has been implemented in terms of its consistency , its design and the effectiveness of the different activities of the Plan, in line with its policy relevance. The mid-term process evaluation relies exclusively on qualitative methods (e.g.: interviews with relevant actors, secondary analysis of project documents), quantitative methods (e.g.: control group analysis) were not used. **Outcome evaluation** refers to the results attributable to the project, taking into account the extent to which the project has achieved its objectives.

Both the process evaluation and the results evaluation take into account the views of all stakeholders in the project. To establish present process evaluation report, all consortium members implementing the project were contacted during the semi-structured interviews.

The following two subsections (3.1-3.2) present the databases used in this process evaluation and the pre-established set of criteria used in the evaluation, which are used to evaluate the processes of the 4IM project activities.

3.1 Documents and databases used in the evaluation

For the mid-term process evaluation, we rely heavily on the experience of the **semi-structured interviews**. For the process evaluation, 11 interviews were conducted among the consortium members implementing the 4IM project, and the experiences and results of these interviews will be included in the process evaluation report.

In addition to conducting the interviews, the following documents were used for the mid-term process evaluation:

- Submitted tender documentation,
- Gantt chart,
- Grant agreement,
- Quarterly monitoring reports (Q1, Q2, Q3, Q4, Q5),
- Annual Technical report on progress,
- Household survey methodology and brief summary,
- Methodological material produced (see below),
- Request for pre-financing/interim payment

The **methodological materials** produced in the framework of the 4IM project are:

- Initiative for innovative integrated interventions in Miskolc) - (Our place is Miskolc! - VP/2020/003/0218) - Experience model
- Assessment and changes to local policy systems and measures for work package 1.5 Need for changes at local level to ensure effective implementation of the 4IM project
- Detailed plan and implementation tools at municipality level with KACS representatives How to make all changes work effectively in practice for work package 1.6
- The 4IM Integrated Service Package for the target group for work package 2.4
- 2.5 Capacity development service packages in the 4IM project

- 4IM - Methodology and guidelines for work package 3.2 for municipality-level situation assessment, policy change and planning process, resulting in an innovative and tested service package for social inclusion at the end of the 4IM project
- 3.4 4IM Methodology for capacity development services and tools for capacity development in sample areas for target groups and urban actors. For the further development of activities 2.4 and 2.5 of the work plan

3.2 Set of criteria taken into account in the evaluation

Testing relevance: Whether the interventions and measures taken during the implementation of the 4IM project (e.g. methodology, introduction of service packages) are appropriately targeted and address relevant needs. The relevance test also looks at compliance with the objectives.

The project implementation schedule: To assess whether the individual project activities are progressing in line with the milestones, with the gantt-s, whether the monitoring tools put in place (e.g. quarterly monitoring report) are achieving their objectives.

Evaluating effectiveness and usefulness: Operational effectiveness is assessed in terms of organisational effectiveness (whether organisational structures are in place to meet operational objectives, whether human resources are available), as well as the effectiveness of indicator performance and resource use.

The evaluation of usefulness focuses on whether the results achieved by the interventions and measures meet the needs of the target groups and the socio-economic problems to be solved (e.g. targeting and soundness of service packages, activities of local access points).

Exploring participation: How the principle of participation is applied throughout the project, but in particular in the household survey, innovative and integrated services, the operation of community action groups and the planning of community actions.

Exploring partnership: Examining the established organisations and the cooperation and networking between them, with particular attention to the cooperation mechanisms, operational functions and dysfunctions between consortium members.

Identifying success and failure factors: The process evaluation will identify success and failure factors, which will also be assessed using qualitative tools (semi-structured interviews with the project implementers). We analyse the factors that can promote or weaken the effects of the intervention.

The most important factors include the delivery mechanisms, the functioning of the established organisational structures, the effectiveness of governance and the functioning of management.

Sustainability: Assessing the medium- or long-term sustainability of the project's impact, examining which results, organisations, project elements can be continued after the project's funding ends and on what resources.

Proposals for corrections: Recommendations are made to remedy any shortcomings or less efficient functions identified during the process evaluation.

3.3 Examining the links between the 4IM project and the EU's Strategic Framework on Roma

The 4IM pilot project was designed with a particular focus on promoting equal opportunities for marginalised Roma minority populations. In the evaluation process, we will examine the links between the objectives of the EU Strategic Framework on Roma for 2020-2030[6] (hereinafter: strategic framework) and the (sub-)results achieved and activities implemented in the pilot project. The relevant links (indicators) to the strategic framework identified in the 4IM project documents were taken as given in the evaluation - although it is noted that the choice of indicators needs to be reviewed, both for compliance with the EU Roma Strategic Framework and for the specific relevance of the 4IM project intervention areas.

The following three groups of indicators, defined in the 4IM project baseline documents, are reviewed below:

1st indicator group: living conditions of the direct target group,
2nd indicator group: process indicators related to project implementation - partnership,
3rd indicator group: result indicators related to the project implementation - improving the employment of the Roma.

1. indicator group: living conditions of the direct target group

The **output indicators** related to the "reduction of poverty and social exclusion" objective are summarised in the table below. These output indicators are measured among a target group living in selected neighbourhoods in Miskolc.

2 table 1.2 Indicators measuring the living conditions of the direct target group

Indicator name	Which measurement instrument of the household-level survey conducted in the project provides relevant input
1. No consumption of meat, fish or equivalent nutrients every two days	**Household level questionnaire - question 52**
2. Percentage of people living in households where at least one person went to bed hungry in recent months because they had no money to buy food	**Household level questionnaire - question 21**
3. percentage of children aged 0-17 living in households where at least one person has gone to bed hungry in the past month because they had no money to buy food	**Household level questionnaire - questions 4 and 21** (The household-level survey included questions for family members under 16 and over 16.)
4. Percentage of people living in households with (particular) difficulties in making ends meet	**Household level questionnaire - questions 50, 53, 54**
5. Percentage of people without a bank account	**Personal questionnaire - question 21.a**

Resource: own editing

The household survey questionnaires include questions that meet these assessment criteria, and the survey of people living in the two action areas was carried out during the 4IM project. The evaluation of the household survey will provide an overall picture of the living conditions of the target groups, which factors could improve as a direct result of the project.

[6] https://commission.europa.eu/system/files/2021-01/eu_roma_strategic_framework_for_equality_inclusion_and_participation_for_2020_-_2030_0.pdf

2. indicator group: process indicators related to the project implementation - partnership

For the objective "Reducing poverty and social exclusion", **process indicators** have been assigned that can be identified during the implementation of the pilot project activities . These indicators provide qualitative feedback on the involvement and participation of Roma NGOs:

3 *table 1.2 Process indicators related to the project implementation - partnership*

	Indicators
1.	Anti-discrimination awareness training for social service workers
2.	Measures are in place to ensure that Roma are involved in the development of policy responses to reduce social exclusion/poverty affecting them
3.	Roma civil society organisations are involved in the development of measures aimed at Roma exclusion/poverty reduction
4.	Roma civil/community organisations are involved in interventions to improve the marginalised situation of the Roma
5.	Roma NGOs are involved in measuring the results of poverty reduction measures.
6.	The relevant local government organisations have established partnerships with Roma NGOs, business organisations and scientific organisations on issues related to social inclusion.

Resource: own editing

In the design and implementation of the 4IM project, the consortium partners created a local innovation ecosystem through the cooperation of local government (the Municipality of the city of Miskolc with county rights), academia (University of Miskolc), NGOs (HÁRFA, Abaújrakezdés Association, AEIDL) and society (people living in the action areas). The partnership also involves NGOs and other organisations active in the provision of various services and committed to poverty reduction.

3. indicator group: result indicators related to the project implementation - improving the employment of the Roma

The **result indicators** assigned to the objective “effective increase of Roma participation in quality paid and sustainable employment" can be identified as the impact of the pilot project activities .

4 *result indicators related to the project implementation - increasing Roma employment*

	Indicators
1.	A mechanism to support quality employment for Roma is in place and receives the necessary financial resources;
2.	Roma "employment and youth mediator" positions exist in the administrative structure of municipalities with a high proportion of Roma in the population;
3.	Targeted measures are in place to support the formalisation of existing informal employment;
4.	Targeted measures are in place to support Roma employment in public administration;
5.	Skills development and qualification programmes are in place to move out of public works programmes targeting settlements with a high Roma population;
6.	They implement and provide funding for programmes to support young Roma people in gaining their first work experience, job placements and internships, and career development;
7.	Awareness-raising campaigns and targeted trainings to combat discrimination and anti-Gypsyism in the labour market are organised for employment services, trade unions and employers;
8.	Measures are in place to ensure that Roma are involved in shaping political responses to employment
9.	Roma NGOs are involved in monitoring the results of implemented measures;
10.	Municipal institutions and the public administration involve the contribution of Roma civil society, and in particular Roma entrepreneurs and successful Roma professionals, in employment decision-making processes.

Resource: own editing

By continuing to operate the organisational structures that will be put in place, the 4IM project can contribute to the achievement of the result indicators set out in the strategic framework.

In the mid-term process evaluation, the project's contribution to the above indicators is not specifically examined - both because it is appropriate to examine them at the end of the project and because of our criticism of the adequacy of the indicators already described above - but we intend to present them in the end-of-project impact evaluation in the light of these or other related indicators.

4. AREAS, PRIORITIES, WORK PACKAGES

This chapter describes the progress of each of the work packages defined in the 4IM project and the evaluation of the progress of each activity.

The 6 work packages of the 4IM project, the timing and sequencing of the main technical activities and the Gantt chart for the project implementation are presented below to provide a basis for the evaluation.

The 4IM project will implement the following 6 work packages.

2 figure work packages implemented under the of the 4IM project

Work Package 1 - Setting up the necessary structures and capacity building

Work Package 2 - reaching people/households in need

Work Package 3 - Methodological coordination and guidance

Work Package 4 - Impact assessment of project activities

Work Package 5 - Transnational cooperation, mainstreaming and dissemination

Work Package 6 - Project Management

Source: Gantt chart, own editing

The timing and sequencing of the main technical activities of the 4IM project is shown in the table below.

5 table 4.1 the timing of its main professional activities and the sequencing of the 4IM project

Professional activities	Scheduling
Setting up the necessary structures, capacity planning, methodology and guidelines, and creating a communication strategy	Q1-Q2
Carrying out a household-level survey	Q3-Q4
Development and implementation of service packages in the 2 target areas	Q5-Q10
Process evaluation	Q5-Q6
Adaptation - Small-scale pilot implementation of an integrated service model in Košice	Q6-Q10
Evaluation of results	Q9-Q10

Source: Gantt chart, own editing

The project implementation schedule
To assess whether the individual project activities are progressing in line with the milestones, with the gantt-s, whether the monitoring tools put in place (e.g. quarterly monitoring report) are achieving their objectives.

The Gantt chart below shows the detailed schedule of project activities, planned duration, activities carried out, extensions of the duration of the activity, and activities postponed.

The Gantt chart can be interpreted with the following colour explanation:

	Planned duration of the activity
	Activity completed
	Extension of the duration of the activity
	Deferred activity

Overall, based on the Gantt chart, the quarterly monitoring reports and the interviews, it can be said that, in addition to the extension of the duration of the individual activities, the majority of the activities are taking place according to the predefined schedule. The status of each work package is presented in a summary table in the relevant work package chapter.

3 figure Gantt chart of the 4IM project

	Work Package / Task	Timing									
		Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q5	Q6	Q7	Q8	Q9	Q10
	Work Package 1 - Setting up the necessary structures and capacity building										
1.1	Mapping public, private and civil partners at city level (including relevant regional and national bodies)	X	X								
1.2	Building and strengthening public-private-civil partnerships for inclusion at city level through the establishment and operation of the Urban Social Inclusion Committee	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
1.3	Setting up and operating the organisational structure needed to develop innovative and integrated services and interventions	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
1.4	Capacity building for stakeholders at city level		X		X		X		X		X
1.5.	Local policy assessment and changes - what needs to change and changes at local level to ensure effective project implementation (linked to 3.2)		X								
1.6.	Preparation of a detailed plan and implementation tools at city level with representatives of community action groups (how to effectively implement all changes in practice (linked to 3.2)		X	X	X						
	Work Package 2 - reaching people/households in need										
2.1.	Development of local mobilisation activities in disadvantaged target neighbourhoods (coach team, local mobilisation campaign, interviews with target group members, etc.)	X	X								
2.2.	Establishing and empowering Community Action Groups, facilitating the process of preparing their own assessments and action plans, capacity building		X	X	X						
2.3.	Conducting a household-level survey with the help of Community Action Groups			X	X						
2.4.	Pilot implementation of services based on an integrated approach (linked to 3.4)					X	X	X	X	X	X
2.5.	Professional and other thematic training, capacity building					X	X	X	X	X	X
2.6.	Implementing community actions as capacity building tools at municipal level		X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	
2.7.	Small-scale pilot implementation of an integrated service model in Košice						X	X	X	X	X
	Work Package 3 - Methodological coordination and guidance										
3.1.	Developing the communication strategy	X	x	x	x						
3.2.	Preparation of a methodology and guidelines for city-level evaluation, policy changes and planning process (points 1.5 and 1.6)	X	X	x	x						
3.3.	Developing a methodology for a participatory household survey		X								

3.4.	Developing a methodology for target group services (linked to 2.4) and capacity development tools (2.5)			X	X							
3.5.	Professional-methodological management	X	X	X	X	X	X	X				
3.6.	Policy governance	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	
	Work Package 4 - Impact assessment of project activities											
4.1.	Impact assessment of project activities - process evaluation					X	X					
4.2	Impact assessment of project activities - evaluation of the results									X	X	
	Work Package 5 - Transnational cooperation, mainstreaming and dissemination											
5.1.	Organisation of a project launch conference	X	x									
5.2.	Implementing staff training	X	X	X	X	x						
5.3.	International cooperation meetings, exchange of experience, networking		X		X		X		X		X	
5.4.	The organisation of 2 international study visits						X		X			
5.5.	Develop dissemination content, output products, publications, knowledge transfer documents	X	X		X		X		X		X	
5.6.	Intra-country knowledge transfer through the National Social Innovation Laboratory	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	
5.7.	Organising an international conference to share experiences										X	
5.8.	Lessons learned, ensuring sustainability									X	X	
	Work Package 6 - Project Management											
6.1.	Establishment of the technical conditions necessary for the implementation of the project (contracts, staff, offices, equipment, etc.)	X	X									
6.2.	Participation in a kick-off meeting in Brussels	X										
6.3.	Organisation of a consortium coordination meeting	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	
6.4.	Contract- and financial management, procurement, accounting	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	
6.5.	Professional progress and monitoring	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	
6.6.	Participation in the final networking and experience-sharing meeting in Brussels										X	

	Planned duration of the activity
	Activity completed
	Extension of the duration of the activity
	Deferred activity

5.1 Setting up the necessary structures and capacity building

Exploring partnership:
Examining the established organisations and the cooperation and networking between them, with particular attention to the cooperation mechanisms, operational functions and dysfunctions between consortium members.

6. table Work Package 1 - Setting up the necessary structures and capacity building

Work Package / Task		Responsible Applicant or Co-Applicant	Affected Applicant or Co-Applicant	Status (Completed, In Progress)
	Work Package 1 - Setting up the necessary structures and capacity building	MISKOLC		
1.1	Mapping public, private and civil partners at city level (including relevant regional and national bodies)	MISKOLC	Everyone	Completed
1.2	Building and strengthening public-private-civil partnerships for inclusion at city level through the establishment and operation of the Urban Social Inclusion Committee	MISKOLC	Everyone	In progress
1.3	Setting up and operating the organisational structure needed to develop innovative and integrated services and interventions	MISKOLC	Everyone	In progress
1.4	Capacity building for stakeholders at city level	HÁRFA	Everyone	In progress
1.5.	Local policy assessment and changes - what needs to change and changes at local level to ensure effective project implementation (linked to 3.2)	MISKOLC	Everyone	Completed
1.6.	Preparation of a detailed plan and implementation tools at city level with representatives of community action groups (how to effectively implement all changes in practice (linked to 3.2)	MISKOLC	Everyone	Completed

Source: Gantt chart, own editing

Organisations created under the 4IM project:

- Social Innovation Standing Working Group (TIÁM) - (informal working group of the Social Inclusion Committee)
- Social Innovation Resource Centre (Bábonyiérc Service Contact Point, Tetemvár Service Contact Point,)
- Community Action Groups (KACS): Bábonyibérc Community Action Group, Tetemvár Community Action Group (local residents' organisation)

4 figure The hierarchy of the organisations set up under the 4IM project

Source: The 4IM Integrated Service Package for the target group for work package 2.4

In the framework of the 4IM project, a **Social Innovation Resource Centre** (hereinafter: Resource Centre) has been set up, which works in cooperation with various municipal departments (Coordination Department, Social Affairs and Public Education Department, Public Services Department, Press, Communication and City Marketing Department). The Resource Centre was established at the Public Services Department of Miskolc Municipality. The role of the Resource Centre is to ensure professional coordination between partners for the implementation of the integrated social-employment pilot service packages. The Resource Centre also runs the Service Contact Points and supports the work of the Community Action Groups. The Resource Centre employs 5 staff. 1 full-time Resource Centre manager, 2 full-time field service coordinators since 15 January 2023, 2 part-time community coaches since May 2022, and 2 10-hour interns (1 university student to assist with administrative and office work, 1 local resident to assist with field work) The two coordinators work with the coach to visit households, assess needs and provide services, while the coach is responsible for engaging additional households.

Following the mapping of public, private and civil partners at city level, **a partner map** was produced, involving nearly 100 organisations, based on an interview with the Head of the Resource Centre and the Q4 quarterly monitoring report.

The **Social Innovation Standing Working Group** (hereinafter referred to as TIÁM) grew out of the former Neighbourhoods in Need Working Group, started with 33 organisations from the partnermapped public, civil and business actors in Miskolc, and held its first meeting in April 2022. *"This cooperation and this activity has now reached the point where we have found about 15 organisations who, while keeping even their own interests in the bacjground, are showing a real commitment to the inclusion of the 2 target areas and then of the remaining 14 target areas."* The following cooperation with public, civil and economic actors can be highlighted: Miskolci Paktum, Kézfogás (Handshake) Klaszter, Red Cross, MIREHU, Hungarian Charity Service of the Order of Malta, Válságkezelő Egyesület (Crisis Management Association), MESZEGYI, TeatRom Társulat, dr. Ámbédkar, The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, the Salvation Army, Dialóg, Miskolc Holding, Miskolc Városgazda Nonprofit Kft. based on an interview with the head of the Resource Centre. TIÁM is responsible for coordinating the institutionalisation of cooperation between the various public, private and civil actors (general service providers such as health, school, childcare, employment, social development NGOs, local government as a care authority). Sections of the service packages have been

created within TIÁM, and their content has been further developed in the context of the TIÁM meetings. They work closely with the Resource Centre and with the platform of different partners (public, private and civil).

Service Contact Points are responsible for contacting target group members and providing information on integrated services and opportunities. When setting up the Service Contact Points, the 4IM project faced challenges, with a lack of infrastructure of the right quality. In Bábonyibérc, there is a municipally owned property available, but without full access to public utilities, and in Tetemvár there is only one vacant plot available. Therefore, a single Service Contact Point has been set up in Q3 in the municipality building. In Q4, progress was made at the Bábonyibérc Service Contact Point, where, despite a tight municipal budget, the property was made suitable for small events through the work of the Community Action Group and other volunteers. It is still not suitable for continuous work due to the lack of a bathroom. Power and heating were provided by a generator and two oil radiators. One vacant plot of land remains available in Tetemvár. In Q5, a unique development has been designed in Bábonyiérc, linking the deprived part of the city with the affluent part in a so-called "rain garden". This development was also consulted with the wider local community, involving the Chief Gardener and the Chief Architect. As the project progresses, proposals will be made to replace Service Contact Points as physical access points.

Setting up Community Action Groups (KACS): The local community is involved through Community Action Groups. The Bábonyibérc Community Action Group was established in Bábonyibérc with 8 permanent members, ratified by the members with a constitution, an experienced, active community coach is working in the area. The Hungarian Charity Service of the Order of Malta has been present in Tetemvár for years, and after initial difficulties, the cooperation with the 4IM project staff is efficient and smooth, based on the experience of the interview with the head of the Resource Centre. No new Community Action Group was created, the project joined the existing Crisis Action Group.

The members of the Resource Centre staff are in daily contact with the Community Action Group. On 6 September 2022, the KACS of Bábonyibérc participated in an organisational development training, and on 7 September 2022, the KACS of Tetemvár has attended the organisational development training.

In Q4, a total of 6 community actions were organised and carried out by the Community Action Group. In the framework of these actions, the action group members, together with local residents, volunteers from Miskolc and 4IM project staff, collected rubbish, renovated the community house, held community talks and created a community garden. The Community Action Group holds an operational coordination meeting on a weekly basis.

Examining established organisations and the cooperation among them:

The necessary structures and capacity building are being put in place and the organisational structure to develop innovative and integrated services and interventions is being put in place as the 4IM project is implemented. Based on the experience of the interviews, one of the key success factors was the establishment of the Social Innovation Resource Centre, which plays a prominent and active role, the network of partners is well functioning, operated by the Resource Centre.

It can be concluded from the above that Bábonyibérc and Tetemvár are at different stages in the process of setting up the necessary structures, due to their different situations. A shortcoming is that in Tetemvár, in Q4, neither a Service Contact Point nor a Community Action Group was set up under the 4IM project, the project joined an already existing crisis management team in the area. In the long term, the aim is to provide adequate access points in the two target areas.

The establishment of the Social Innovation Committee, undertaken in the framework of the 4IM project, was not completed in committee form between Q1-Q5.

5.2 Reaching people/households in need

Exploring participation:
How the principle of participation is applied throughout the project, but in particular in the household survey, the innovative and integrated services, the operation of community action groups and the planning of community actions.

7. table Work Package 2 - Reaching people/households in need

Work Package / Task		Responsible Applicant or Co-Applicant	Affected Applicant or Co-Applicant	Status (Completed, In Progress)
	Work Package 2 - reaching people/households in need	ABAÚJRAKEZDÉS		
2.1.	Development of local mobilisation activities in disadvantaged target neighbourhoods (coach team, local mobilisation campaign, interviews with target group members, etc.)	ABAÚJRAKEZDÉS	MISKOLC	Completed
2.2.	Establishing and empowering Community Action Groups, facilitating the process of preparing their own assessments and action plans, capacity building	ABAÚJRAKEZDÉS	MISKOLC, UM	Completed
2.3.	Conducting a household-level survey with the help of Community Action Groups	UM	MISKOLC, HÁRFA, ABAÚJRAKEZDÉS	Implemented in the two target areas
2.4.	Pilot implementation of services based on an integrated approach (linked to 3.4)	MISKOLC	ABA, AMBEDKAR, DIALOG	In progress
2.5.	Professional and other thematic training, capacity building	ABAÚJRAKEZDÉS	MISKOLC	In progress
2.6.	Implementing community actions as capacity building tools at municipal level	ABAUJRAKEZDES	MISKOLC	In progress
2.7.	Small-scale pilot implementation of an integrated service model in Košice	KOŠICE	MISKOLC	Later activity

Source: Gantt chart, own editing

The Community Action Groups and the coach team are described in chapter 5.1, below the other activities of Work Package 2 are presented, with a focus on the household level survey and the service packages based on the integrated approach.

The household-level survey was conducted through a questionnaire survey with the help of interviewers between 14 June and 5 August 2022. The survey was preceded by the preparation of interviewers and a field visit to identify the different parts of the municipality, with the help of the Resource Centre staff.

The survey was carried out using 3 forms:

- Individual fact sheet on the household members (all over 16 years)
- Household questionnare,
- Personal questionnaire.

The population of the survey is the population living in the affected areas of Bábonyibérc (both sides of the new Bábonyibérc area - Bábonyibérc sor - Bábonyibérc Felső sor – Alsó sor, Galagonyás sor) and the affected areas of Tetemvár (Tetemvár felső, alsó és középső sor, Tetemvár sor). The unit of observation is the household, the unit of analysis is the individual, the household, the community and the neighbourhood.

“Our investigation was conducted along three main problem areas (dimensions):

- Socio-demographic situation (household composition, level of education, employment, housing, children, health status, deviances)
- Attachments, motivations (weak and strong ties inside and outside the neighbourhood, connections and embeddedness, local attachment and involvement in local issues)
- Resources (financial, physical, psychological, social and existing competences of the population)”[7]

Based on exploring the situation and community participation, the following 6 integrated service packages have been developed under the 4IM project:

1.Package of services for employment-development
2.Package of services related to education
3.Housing-related service package
4.Package of services to improve physical living conditions
5.Community service package
6.Package of services enabling the provision of an unconditional basic income

In Q4, progress is being made on the package of services related to employment-development and education, with the related working groups meeting 2-2 times. In Q5, in connection with the education service package, sibling classes were established between disadvantaged primary schools and upper middle class secondary schools aiming at segregated educational institutions in the target area, thus opening the way for pupils from deprived neighbourhoods to grammar school studies. One of the priorities of the employment-development package is the support for the purchase of monthly transport passes in the first month after starting work. The school district helped launch the education package, facilitating contacts with the two primary schools and two secondary schools in the target areas, but has not been actively involved in the implementation of the programmes since then. In Q5, the Employment Task Force started implementing the action plan, with 2 people employed since the introduction of the service package. The housing-related service package aims to settle the legal aspects of home ownership, and includes legal assistance, with the necessary legal partner still being sought. The Resource Centre has contacted TASZ, but cooperation is still pending. In Q5, the project started to seek resources for the removal of the illegal waste generated under this service package, in close cooperation with MIREHU. In areas where the utility service charge is settled, the "extra bin" project has been launched, where there is no settled contract, gaps will be identified and assistance

[7] The "trapped", the "apathetic", the "resigned poor" - a sociological vision of two segregated areas of Miskolc Kinga Szabó-Tóth, Helga Mihályi

will be provided to conclude the contract. The physical improvement package aims to complete house renovation and refurbishment works by providing basic building materials and mentoring. The community service package includes organising community meetings, running a community centre, organising events linked to public holidays and ensuring a permanent presence. A service package to provide unconditional basic income will include a rethinking of the city's financial support system and in-kind benefits at municipality level, linking them to service packages and service development.[8]

The pilot implementation of the service packages based on the integrated approach is in its initial phase at the time of writing this process evaluation report, with the first phase of implementation, also based on the Gantt chart schedule, to be introduced in Q5, so their impact will be assessed in the results evaluation report.

The current situation of integrated service packages, the conditions of their development and the processes of sequencing are assessed.

The design of service packages in the 4IM project:

Based on the interviews and monitoring reports, the 4IM project conducted 3 public interviews respectively in both target areas from March to summer 2022, resulting in a large number of public forums, and a problem identification process carried out by the coaches, which assessed local needs, wants and problems with the involvement of local people. These needs and problems form the basis for the design of service packages. So the population in the target area and the needs that arise have been identified.

Although the household panel was focused on the results of the survey, a detailed research report was not made on which the service packages could rely, however this gap was overcome by the cooperation between the Resource Centre and the University of Miskolc, and the comprehensive results of the household panel were shared by the Resource Centre staff when developing the service packages.

Sections within TIÁM have been created in accordance with the service packages. At the TIÁM meetings in Q4, the content of the service packages was deepened and action plans were developed for each package.[9]

A methodological document "2.5 Capacity Development Service Packages in the 4IM Project" has been prepared, which proposes capacity development packages at city level and at target area level. Other thematic services and capacity building tools will be launched in 2023, involving Community Action Groups, in cooperation with the Resource Centre.[10]

The integrated service model is lagging behind in the period Q1-Q5. The service packages defined by the Resource Centre are parallel sectoral service packages operating side by side, with a lagging professional management, as confirmed by the experience of the interviews conducted.

At the same time, it is important to stress that the activities in the service packages are well-targeted, tailored to the needs of the people living in the two target areas and useful.

The intensity of activities under each service package varies. Progress is visible in the employment-development and education packages, steps have been taken to implement the housing package,

[8] The 4IM Integrated Service Package for the target group for work package 2.4

[9] Some action plans for the service packages were not provided during the preparation of the process evaluation report.

[10] Correction Abaújrakezdés Association: The word 'training' is wrongly included in the name of the activity.

monitoring reports show that the physical improvement and community services package is progressing less intensively and the unconditional basic income package is seriously lagging behind.

5.3 Methodological coordination and guidance

8. table Work Package 3 - Methodological coordination and guidance

Work Package / Task		Responsible Applicant or Co-Applicant	Affected Applicant or Co-Applicant	Status (Completed, In Progress)
	Work Package 3 - Methodological coordination and guidance	ABAÚJRAKEZDÉS		
3.1.	Developing the communication strategy	MISKOLC	HÁRFA	Completed
3.2.	Preparation of a methodology and guidelines for city-level evaluation, policy changes and planning process (points 1.5 and 1.6)	HÁRFA	ABAÚJRAKEZDÉS	Completed
3.3.	Developing a methodology for a participatory household survey	UM	ABAÚJRAKEZDÉS	Completed
3.4.	Developing a methodology for target group services (linked to 2.4) and capacity development tools (2.5)	ABAÚJRAKEZDÉS	HÁRFA	Completed
3.5.	Professional-methodological management	AEIDL		In progress
3.6.	Policy governance	ABAÚJRAKEZDÉS		In progress

Source: Gantt chart, own editing

The methodological documents are developed to coordinate and harmonise the activities of the consortium partners and to achieve the objectives of the project. As a pilot project for social innovation, the recording of the methodology is also of particular importance for the scalability and further development of the innovation.

The methodological documents developed in the framework of the 4IM pilot project for the period Q1-Q5 are:

- **3.1 Communication strategy**

A Communication Strategy and Manual has been prepared in the framework of the 4IM project, which describes and defines the messages and the target audience of the project, the communication tools, the dissemination channels, and the involvement and information activities. The strategy also serves as an internal manual to facilitate cooperation between the consortium partners and defines the identity elements for a coherent project presentation.

The evaluation found that the communication strategy is not fulfilling its role, no periodic action plan for its implementation was made, and there is no news or publicity about the 4IM project.

- **4IM - Methodology and guidelines for work package 3.2 for city-level situation assessment, policy change and planning process, resulting in an innovative and tested service package for social inclusion at the end of the 4IM project**

The document details all the new organisational structures that will be created and operated during the pilot project (see details in chapter 5.1), which aim to change the social service system and the management structure at city level in order to create an integrated, multi-stakeholder public service

system in Miskolc. The document does not include a proposal on how and according to which criteria the city - and, as a pilot project, other municipalities - should measure the financial and in-kind benefits available to the direct target group and how they should be evaluated according to which analytical criteria. Furthermore, the link between the field experience and the review of service systems is not reflected in the methodology.

The structure of the document **"Evaluation and changes to the local policy system and measures for work package 1.5 Need for local changes for an effective implementation of the 4IM project"** does not follow a clear logic, with each chapter containing lists without introductory and explanatory sections.

The analysis points out in section 4.2.6 that the number of claimed subsidies determined by the municipality is relatively low in relation to the population, but the derivation on which the conclusion is based is not available. Chapter 4.2.7 also contains proposals that are not related to the "analyses" in the previous chapters of the document.

Chapter 6 presents the existing network of the city of Miskolc, but apart from the list of the partner network active in the target area, we do not get information about the activities of the partners and the analysis of their connections.

There is a lack of inventory and assessment of existing social, health, employment and education services, an assessment of their capacities, a mapping of existing cooperation and areas of gaps, and a subsequent attempt to develop an integrated model.

Furthermore, factual errors need to be corrected, e.g. 1.4 Vicious circles in the benefit system: people under 25 can no longer be in public employment (see Youth Guarantee Programme); in Chapter 3, the designation of pre-school care, student status, student card as a social service, etc.

- **3.3 The methodology of the 4IM survey**

The methodology document of the household survey includes the purpose of the survey and the research, the definition of the population, the data collection methodology of the survey, the planned date of data collection and the questionnaires. However, the methodology does not address the analytical aspects of the survey, nor does it provide a basis for examining the contexts that could be included as inputs to the new integrated service system.

- **3.4 4IM Methodology for capacity development services for target groups and urban actors, and for capacity development tools used in sample areas For the further development of activities 2.4 and 2.5 of the work plan**

The 4IM project is building a new partnership between the Municipality of Miskolc, local integration associations and foundations, social service providers and local communities. It strengthens the capacity of communities to organise themselves in two neighbourhoods of Miskolc with a high density of poor and excluded residents, often of Roma ethnicity. The methodology document describes in detail the purpose of capacity development of urban actors (chapter 4.1), and then points to the new organisational structures (TIÁM, Resource Centre) as methodological elements for capacity development. In Chapter 5, it identifies, by sectoral intervention area and without specifying the source, the problems, proposed solutions and related partners in both target areas that affect the immediate target group of the project. Chapter 6 is expected to describe guidelines for the development of capacity development tools, but rather contains the list of impacts of the desired cooperation - without a breakdown of the project activities that are to put in place to achieve the impact.

The products of the activity 3.4 Developing a methodology for target group services (linked to 2.4) and capacity development tools (2.5) will be reviewed by the consortium partners by mutual agreement at a later stage of the project, which is desired as per the aforementioned statements as well.

5.4 Impact assessment of the project activities

9. *table Work Package 4 - Impact assessment of project activities*

Work Package / Task		Responsible Applicant or Co-Applicant	Affected Applicant or Co-Applicant	Status (Completed, In Progress)
	Work Package 4 - Impact assessment of project activities	HÁRFA		
4.1.	Impact assessment of project activities - process evaluation	HÁRFA		In progress
4.2	Impact assessment of project activities - evaluation of the results	HÁRFA		Later activity

Source: Gantt chart, own editing

The present mid-term process evaluation and the results evaluation are part of this Work Package, these project activities will not be evaluated.

5.5 Transnational cooperation, mainstreaming and dissemination

10. *table Work Package 5 - Transnational cooperation, mainstreaming and dissemination*

Work Package / Task		Responsible Applicant or Co-Applicant	Affected Applicant or Co-Applicant	Status (Completed, In Progress)
	Work Package 5 - Transnational cooperation, mainstreaming and dissemination	HÁRFA		
5.1.	Organisation of a project launch conference	KOŠICE	Everyone	Completed
5.2.	Implementing staff training	HÁRFA	Everyone	Completed
5.3.	International cooperation meetings, exchange of experience, networking	HÁRFA	Everyone	In progress
5.4.	The organisation of 2 international study visits	AEIDL	Everyone	In progress
5.5.	Develop dissemination content, output products, publications, knowledge transfer documents	AEIDL	KOŠICE	In progress
5.6.	Intra-country knowledge transfer through the National Social Innovation Laboratory	HÁRFA		In progress

5.7.	Organising an international conference to share experiences	MISKOLC	Everyone	Later activity
5.8.	Lessons learned, ensuring sustainability	ABAÚJRAKEZDÉS		Later activity

Source: Gantt chart, own editing

The kick-off conference took place in a hybrid format in Košice on 1 June 2022.

The training of the consortium partnership participants was carried out on 3 occasions: 3 March 2022 staff training - project management, communication strategy, 7 September 2022 staff training - developing communication, 25 May 2022 staff training - introductory networking.

2 international study visits are being organised, with the aim of visiting other European Roma integration best practices. The AEIDL team has started planning the next international study visits (Q6 - Spring 2023; Q8 - Autumn 2023) with the aim of facilitating mutual learning with parallel projects working on Roma integration.

In AEIDL Q4, an English language website was created within the 4IM project's own website, where all project information, news and relevant materials were gathered for an international audience.[11]

The social innovation character of the 4IM project was presented at the ELTE Innovation Day organised in Budapest on 10-11 October 2022 in the framework of the National Laboratory for Social Innovation, as well as at several thematic forums and other partner events during the first five quarters.

In Q5, in order to ensure sustainability, the search for funding and fundraising opportunities has started, with the focus on the sustainability and institutionalisation of the Resource Centre.

[11] The English version of the website is available here: https://www.aeidl.eu/project/establishing-interventions-support-vulnerable-people-miskolc/

5.6 Project management

Exploring partnership:
Examining the established organisations and the cooperation and networking between them, with particular attention to the cooperation mechanisms, operational functions and dysfunctions between consortium members.

11. *table Work Package 6 - Project Management*

Work Package / Task		Responsible Applicant or Co-Applicant	Affected Applicant or Co-Applicant	Status (Completed, In Progress)
	Work Package 6 - Project Management	MISKOLC		
6.1.	Establishment of the technical conditions necessary for the implementation of the project (contracts, staff, offices, equipment, etc.)	Everyone		Completed
6.2.	Participation in a kick-off meeting in Brussels	MISKOLC	Everyone	Completed
6.3.	Organisation of a consortium coordination meeting	MISKOLC	Everyone	In progress
6.4.	Contract- and financial management, procurement, accounting	Everyone	Everyone	In progress
6.5.	Professional progress and monitoring	Everyone	Everyone	In progress
6.6.	Participation in the final networking and experience-sharing meeting in Brussels	MISKOLC	Everyone	Later activity

Source: Gantt chart, own editing

The technical conditions (contracts, staff, offices, equipment, etc.) needed to implement the project are in place, with some delays.

The Brussles kick-off meeting took place online on 25-26 January 2022. Consortium coordination meetings are held regularly.

A monitoring system is in place to ensure professional progress and follow-up, and detailed quarterly monitoring reports are continuously produced under the 4IM project, which have been used in this process evaluation report.

There is a good cooperation with the associated members - Dr. Ámbédkar Youth Association, Dialóg a Közösségekért (Dialogue for Communities) Public Benefit Association - they participate in the TIÁM meetings, the training courses of the Ámbédkar are regularly advertised by the Resource Centre in their Facebook group and in the community events of the residents. Dialóg community organiser's training was attended by the members of the Community Action Group, they regularly hold community actions in the target areas and they held two organisational development sessions for the Resource Centre.

Cooperation between consortium members:

There are difficulties and obstacles in the communication among consortium members. The problem identified in the interviews carried out and in the monitoring report is the difficulty of communication among the consortium members. In the Q4 quarterly monitoring report, the following is stated: "Also a problem and a hindering factor is the tense, almost hostile relationship between the project's technical leader and some consortium members."

The difficulty of scarce communication with AEIDL was also indicated in the monitoring reports and in the interviews conducted. To solve this problem, we recommend a monthly, even written (via e-mail) flow of information to AEIDL about the project's events and results, as well as a quick translation of the Hungarian-language press materials.

A further difficulty was the inability of the partner city of Košice to play an active role in the project (they did not participate in the meeting in September and November 2022). In Q5, progress was made, the 4IM project experience has been handed over to Košice, and at the next quarterly consortium meeting Košice will show the organisational structure that will be presented as an innovation. The stronger involvement of the partner city of Košice is needed, the knowledge of the project processes and results is necessary for the adaptation process starting in Q6.

The project must be carried out in an effective and equal cooperation between the consortium partners, rather than in a one-man top-down management style.

5. MONITORING, INDICATORS

The structure and content of the monitoring reports are suitable for monitoring the processes and activities of the 4IM project.

The quarterly monitoring reports include the technical summaries of the given period by activity and by consortium member, the results achieved in the given quarter, the ongoing activities by work package, as well as the issues and problems encountered during the implementation of the 4IM project, the activities planned for the next quarter, the current value of the indicators undertaken in the framework of the project, the project events, workshops, target group trainings, consortium meetings, the communication products produced and the procurement activities carried out in the framework of the project.

6 output indicators and 3 result indicators have been committed to in the 4IM project. The table below shows the targets and current values of the 9 indicators committed to under the project. The current indicator values up to Q5 is briefly summarised here.

It is important to underline that no documentation was available during the process evaluation to support the indicators. In general, it is recommended that the documents supporting the achievement of each indicator (e.g. cooperation agreements, evaluation reports, certificates, etc.) are collected separately per indicator and made available to all consortium members.

Output indicators:

1st indicator: indicator target met, indicator over-achieved, number of partnerships established 20 (target for the indicator is 3 organisations).

2nd indicator: the current indicator value is the value of the next Social Innovation Standing Group workshops, which took place on the following dates: 25 May 2022, 6 September 2022, 10 October 2022.

3rd indicator: 10 workshops were held, the indicator target was met.

4th indicator: 104 households were surveyed during the household survey, significantly exceeding the indicator target (the indicator target was 30 households surveyed).

7th indicator: 50 target groups were reached or supported.

8th indicator: the indicator is currently set to 0 and will be implemented at a later stage of the project.

Result indicators:

5th indicator: the current value of the indicator is 0, the proposal for an integrated pilot scheme will be implemented at a later stage of the project.

6th indicator: the indicator is currently set to 0 and will be implemented at a later stage of the project.

9th indicator: the current value of the indicator is 3, i.e. 3 people have a certificate of employment competence development.

12 table. 4IM project indicator commitments and achievements

	Indicator description	Unit of measurement	Target value	Current value	Tools of control	Type of indicator
I.	**Multi-level, multi-stakeholder partnerships are set up, information exchange and rules of procedure are developed and mutually agreed (tool: the city's Social Innovation Committee)**					
1	Number of partnerships established (public, private and civil partners), networking in the project; the city's Social Innovation Committee	number of organisations	3	20	cooperation agreement evaluation report	Output
2	Number of professional and other thematic training courses, workshops	number of training courses	10	3	attendance sheet training report	Output
II.	**The partnerships established promote and regularly evaluate the newly tested implementation of services (tool: Social Innovation Resource Centre)**					
3	Local policy evaluation	number of workshops	10	10	evaluation reports	Output
III.	**Partnerships work together to achieve jointly defined common goals, such as solving specific problems**					
4	Services based on an integrated approach	number of household surveys	30	104	survey	Output
5	Integrated pilot scheme	number of proposals	1		proposal	Result
IV.	**Reaching or supporting specific target groups (tools: Access Points and Community Action Groups)**					
6	Number of non-registered persons participating in the project	person(s)	100		survey	Result
7	Persons who have a registered address in Miskolc but who have difficulties in accessing employment opportunities and social benefits (e.g. vulnerable Roma women, Roma youth)	person(s)	300	50	survey	Output
8	People who have the motivation, work experience and educational qualifications to integrate easily into the labour market (e.g. young people at risk)	person(s)	50		attendance sheet (75% of training sessions are compulsory)	Output
9	Persons whose employment competence has improved	person(s)	20	3	certificate	Result

Source: Q5 quarterly monitoring report

6. EFFICIENCY OF RESOURCE USE

Based on the experience of the interviews with the project management and financial management and the pre-financing request for the first year, the following shows the distribution and use of resources among the consortium members and the use of own resources by each consortium member in relation to the activities and tasks carried out.

13. *table Distribution of resources between consortium partners*

Consortium members	Breakdown of project resources (Euro)	Breakdown of project resources (%)
The Municipality of Miskolc City with County Rights CONSORTIUM LEADER	378,459.00	35.52%
HÁRFA (Network for Regional Development Foundation)	274,291.82	25.75%
Abaújrakezdés Public Benefit Association	264,887.06	24.86%
AEIDL (European Association for Innovation in Local Development)	72,840.25	6.84%
Municipality of Košice	49,999.99	4.69%
University of Miskolc	24,920.30	2.34%
Total	**1,065,398.42**	**100%**

Source: VS/2021/0249 grant agreement, own editing

The rate of use of resources based on the first annual pre-financing request is shown in the table below.

14. *table Use of resource for the period 27.11.2021-20.11.26.2022*

Consortium members	Use of resource (27.11.2021.-26.11.2022.) Euro
The Municipality of Miskolc City with County Rights CONSORTIUM LEADER	57,560.77
HÁRFA (Network for Regional Development Foundation)	59,939.93
Abaújrakezdés Public Benefit Association	50,154.56
AEIDL (European Association for Innovation in Local Development)	18,172.54
Municipality of Košice	2,597.53
University of Miskolc	4,819.82
Total	**193,245.15**

Source: Request for pre-financing/interim payment, own editing

Based on the first annual pre-financing request and interviews with project management and financial management, the full advance payment has not been cleared, with a backlog of around 30% for the City of Košice and 10-15% for the Municipality of Miskolc, and no significant backlog for the other consortium partners.

In relation to the ratio of the consortium members' own resources to the activities and tasks carried out, the experience of the interview with the financial management shows that the City of Košice is the most backlogged, and there is also a backlog in clearing the payroll. In the case of the Municipality of Miskolc, public procurement complicates the use of resources, as no procurement expert was originally planned in the project. Abaújrakezdés Public Benefit Association has accounted for wages and expertise. AEIDL and HÁRFA have almost reached the total use of their allocation for the period. The grant has not been overused.

7. SUSTAINABILITY

Sustainability
Evaluation of the medium- or long-term sustainability of the project's impact, examining which results, organisations and project elements can be maintained after the project's funding ends, and which resources can be used to continue the project.

Social innovations typically go through stages, called levels of development, with the first stage being problem identification and the definition of the stage of development of the social innovation, and the final stages being adaptability and sustainability.[12]

If a pilot project is successful, the process of sustaining the new model will follow - either as a new organisation or as a new function within an existing institution. The sustainability assessment should identify those activities and project elements that need to be made sustainable and those that need to be scaled up to achieve systemic change.

The 4IM project activity "5.8 Lessons learned, ensuring sustainability" will develop elements to ensure sustainability. It is recommended that a long-term Sustainability Plan be developed after the completion of the project, detailing how the municipality can incorporate the project activities into its own services.

Based on the experience of the interviews, the role of the **Resource Centre** stands out among the organisations. As it was said he said in the interview, *"We expect the Resource Centre to be integrated into the city's operations - that's what we need to focus on to get the city to push this through."* After the termination of the support of the 4IM project and the closure of the project, if the pilot model can be successfully operated in Miskolc, it is important to maintain the Resource Centre and the Service Contact Points closely cooperating with it in the organisational structure as a sustainable organisation, and to establish new Service Contact Points in further slums. To do this, it is essential to assess and provide the necessary infrastructure or the resources to build it.

In the framework of the 4IM project, a social integration expert **platform** (hereinafter: Platform) was established, which is assigned to the decision-making processes of the City of Miskolc, with the aim of monitoring the city's developments, investments and soft projects from the point of view of social inclusion and social integration - its management and formal organization is proposed. It is proposed that the Platform's experts have a legitimate mandate to make proposals during the preparation of specific developments, interventions and projects, as well as in the pre-decision and decision-making processes.

[12] https://innovationsfonden.dk/sites/default/files/2019-03/societal_readiness_levels_-_srl.pdf

8. PROPOSALS

Below we present our recommendations for corrective actions based on the difficulties, shortcomings and areas for improvement identified during the process evaluation, which were identified in Chapter 5 on a work package by work package basis, and which are intended to provide potential intervention recommendations for the activities of the next project implementation period (Q6-Q10), as well as to prepare the inputs necessary for the success of the final project evaluation report.

Proposals for corrections:
Recommendations are made to remedy any shortcomings or less efficient functions identified during the process evaluation.

Highlighted proposals at project level:

- the creation of a programme steering committee, integrating the consortium members and the organisations set up by the project (e.g. the Resource Centre), the members of which will be jointly responsible for the development and dissemination of project results, instead of a single person management.
- the further development of methodological documents to fulfil their role in supporting the adaptability of pilot projects and to support the ongoing analyses that are essential for the further development of new and integrated service packages. An important commitment of the 4IM project is that the new integrated systems will, among other things, draw on the analysis of the dysfunctionality of existing systems, the results of a household survey of people living in the target areas, in order to implement Principle 14 of the European Pillar of Social Rights.
- we believe that focused, small-scale interventions are more appropriate for a pilot project at such an early stage, rather than seeking and finding a solution for everything at once approach, and therefore we recommend that the services that are set up to support the target group (households or individuals) should be rethought, taking into account their sustainability aspects.
- learning from similar projects, learning from each other would be a useful input for the current phase of the project, and we also suggest to channel in the practical experience of the international project partner (AEIDL).

Work Package 1 - Setting up the necessary structures and capacity building

The long-term objective should be to **provide an adequate access point** in the two target areas. Due to their different situations, Bábonyiérc and Tetemvár are at different stages in the process of setting up the necessary structures. A single Service Contact Point has been set up in the municipality building. As a shortcoming, neither a Service Contact Point nor a Community Action Group was set up in Q4 in Tetemvár. The Service Contact Point in Bábonyibérc is technically not suitable for its permanent operation.

Based on the experience of the interviews, it may be reasonable **to involve additional organisations and actors**: the involvement of the Roma national minority self-government and other Roma organisations, the creation of a better framework for cooperation with the school district.

The 4IM project launched the social - **integration expert platform** assigned to the decision-making processes of the City of Miskolc, and its continuous operation is proposed after the implementation of the 4IM project.

The establishment of the **Social Innovation Committee** in the form of a committee, as undertaken in the framework of the 4IM project under output indicators 1, has not been completed between Q1-Q5, and the Committee needs to be set up and run in accordance with its role as undertaken in the project.

Within the framework of Work Package 1, the **Municipal Social Inclusion Committee** appears in Activity 1.2, but its tasks, its position in the organisational structure and its relation to the Social Innovation Committee are not yet sufficiently clear. We recommend clarifying the names of organisations and developing a systemic operational framework.

Work Package 2 - reaching people/households in need

A household-level survey was carried out at the beginning of the project, but the results (104 household questionnaires) were not reported in detail in the research report. Detailed data processing should be part of the research process, so that the research results can be accessible and used in the project activities. We recommend the **preparation of a detailed research report**, which goes beyond the situation analysis and description of the basic data, and includes a household-level evaluation. The resources not yet used by the University of Miskolc for the preparation of the detailed research report provide an opportunity to do so (see chapter 6. on the efficiency of resource use).

The service packages are based on local needs - partner meetings have been organised at least 20 times - but they have been less able to rely on the results of the household panel, due to the lack of a detailed research report. However, this gap has been overcome thanks to the cooperation between the Resource Centre and the University of Miskolc, and the comprehensive results of the household panel have been shared by the Resource Centre staff in the development of the service packages.

When preparing a detailed analysis of the household survey, it is recommended that the detailed research report should take into account the indicators set out in the EU Roma Strategic Framework, the results for the target areas, and show the relationships between the variables.

The prevalence of the principle of participation is crucial for the success of the 4IM project. A literature recommendation is provided below[13].

[13] Részvételi akciókutatás (RAK) -egy alternatív társadalomkutatási megközelítés a működőképes tudásért és társadalmi változásokért (Participatory Action Research (RAK) - an alternative social research approach for actionable knowledge and social change) (Málovics György –Juhász Judit –Mihók Barbara –Szentistványi István –Nagy Mihály) http://www.jgypk.u-szeged.hu/download.php?docID=100805

Részvételi technikák és a marginalizált társadalmi csoportok részvétele a helyi fejlesztési döntésekben (Participatory techniques and the participation of marginalized social groups in local development decisions) (Málovics György– Juhász Judit –Méreiné Berki Boglárka) https://oszkdk.oszk.hu/DRJ/14575

IKSZT Kézikönyv – Szolgáltató faluházak módszertani és minőségügyi kézikönyve (IKSZT Manual - Methodological and quality manual for service village houses) https://ikszt.modszerkozpont.hu/kezikonyv/IKSZT_Kézikönyv_Szolgáltató_faluházak_módszertani_és_minőségügyi_kézikönyve

About community participation, active community involvement: https://cselekvokozossegek.hu/

The integrated service model is lagging behind in the period Q1-Q5. The **service packages** defined by the Resource Centre are parallel sectoral service packages operating side by side, with a lagging professional management, as confirmed by the experience of the interviews conducted. The intensity of activities under each service package varies. Progress is visible in the employment-development and education packages, steps have been taken to implement the housing package, monitoring reports show that the physical improvement and community services package is progressing less intensively and the unconditional basic income package is seriously lagging behind. In Q4, the contents of the service packages were deepened in the TIÁM meetings, action plans were prepared for each package based on the experience of the interviews, but these action plans were not handed over during the mid-term process evaluation.

For result evaluation, we propose to **design**, implement and evaluate **participant evaluation of the service packages**. The results of the participatory evaluation can provide useful input for the further development of services, and the evaluation by the target group will also strengthen the participatory principle.

The results of the pilot model will be disseminated locally in the other 16 identified deprived neighbourhoods of Miskolc, in the partner city of Košice, and at European level, with the help of the European partner organisation AEIDL.Therefore, a stronger emphasis on **adaptability** is recommended in the next phase of the project. A small-scale pilot implementation of the integrated service model in Košice is planned for Q6.

Work Package 3 - Methodological coordination and guidance

The organisations implementing the project work together in a wide range of national and international partnerships. The project objectives also aim to introduce new approaches to cooperation and partnership networks to improve the living conditions and opportunities of people living in the target area. The coordination of project activities, the integration of the results, while keeping the focus on the project's objective, is a key task not only for the consortium leader, but also for the partners and experts responsible for methodological coordination and guidance.

The methodological guidelines and descriptions prepared in the preparatory phase of the project contain many valuable findings and suggestions based on the documents available to the evaluators, but they do not constitute a consistent methodological guideline that shows the interconnection and interdependence of the different documents. Although the project's GANTT table provides a guide to the timing of activities, the methodological descriptions do not align partners in the absence of a definition of the responsible persons and the timeframe for the activities.

The evaluation found that the communication strategy is not fulfilling its role, and we recommend the preparation and implementation of a periodic action plan to communicate the 4IM project more effectively.

Work Package 4 - Impact assessment of project activities

The final project evaluation report will focus on the achievement of the objectives set, looking at the results achieved, with a particular emphasis on the participative aspect. To evaluate the impact of project activities, it is necessary to evaluate the participants in the service packages and to analyse and evaluate the results of the household survey in detail.

Work Package 5 - Transnational cooperation, mainstreaming and dissemination

In total, 12 similar **pilot projects** are being carried out across Europe. We encourage the exchange of experience with similar pilot projects, learning from other practices to design useful knowledge transfer and innovation services and actions for the future. Getting to know these pilot projects and organisations can help to better understand the activities covered by the Employment and Social Innovation Programme, what good practices, success and failure factors have been identified in other similar pilot projects.

Following the implementation of the 4IM project, it is worth looking for cooperation opportunities **with other national sectoral projects**, such as those of the Budapest Institute.

The 4IM project activity "5.8 Lessons learned, ensuring sustainability" will develop elements to ensure sustainability. It is recommended that a long-term **Sustainability Plan** be developed after the completion of the 4IM project, detailing how the municipality can integrate the project activities into its own services.

Work Package 6 - Project Management

To improve the **relationship between the consortium partners**, we recommend the help of a professional, mediation between the members. In the Q4 quarterly monitoring report, the following is stated: "Also a problem and a hindering factor is the tense, almost hostile relationship between the project's technical leader and some consortium members." The project must be carried out in an effective and equal cooperation between the consortium partners, rather than in a one-man top-down management style. To this end, we propose the creation of a **programme steering committee**, whose members are jointly responsible for the development and dissemination of project results.

Well structured and regular internal communication is needed. One of the difficulties identified is the scarcity of frequent communication to AEIDL based on the interviews and the quarterly monitoring report. To solve this problem, we recommend a monthly, even written (via e-mail) flow of information to AEIDL about the project's events and results. The translation of articles published in the Hungarian press into English can further improve the flow of information, thus contributing to the international dissemination and communication of the project's results.

Stronger involvement of the partner city of Košice is needed (they did not participate in the meetings in September and November 2022), knowledge of the project processes and results is necessary for the adaptation process starting in Q6.

As regards project documentation in general, it is recommended that the documents supporting the achievement of each indicator (e.g. cooperation agreements, evaluation reports, certificates, etc.) are collected separately per indicator and made available to all consortium members.

1. annex List of interviewees

Name:	Organisation	Position
Andrea Klára Varga	The Municipality of Miskolc City with County Rights	deputy mayor, head of policy
László Orosz	The Municipality of Miskolc City with County Rights	project manager
Mónika Szakács	The Municipality of Miskolc City with County Rights	project manager
Viktória Varga Holdiné	The Municipality of Miskolc City with County Rights	finance
Norbert Képes	The Municipality of Miskolc City with County Rights	Resource Centre Manager
Marta Márczis	HÁRFA	professional manager
Gábor Osgyáni	HÁRFA	professional coordinator
Dr Kinga Szabó-Tóth	University of Miskolc	researcher
Balázs Dernei	Abaújrakezdés Association	chair
Patricia Martínez Sáez	AEIDL	
Igor Rolny	Municipality of Košice	